SYSTEMATIC ANALYSIS OF INTEGRATED MARKETING COMMUNICATION RESEARCH

Reza Widhar Pahlevi1*, Narwanto Nurcahyo2
1Program Doktoral Perekonomian Islam dan Industri Halal, Fakultas Sekolah Pascasarjana, Universitas Gadjah Mada
1,2Prodi Kewirausahaan, Universitas Amikom Yogyakarta
E-mail: rezawp@amikom.ac.id
*Corresponding author

Abstract: This study aims to analyze international scientific articles for integrated marketing communication research systematically, both from the perspective of themes, research locations and subjects, as well as the research methods used. This study reviewed 149 scientific articles and presented four main findings. First, the first theme in marketing communications research is integrated with marketing communications and customer relationship management, the second theme deals with the concept known as value added of the plans developed for the role of communication. Second, the questionnaire is a data collection that is predominantly used. Third, research on integrated marketing communications, both in developing and developed countries, has almost the same number of studies. Fourth, based on the bibliometric technique using Vosviewer, it is divided into four clusters and recommends further research agendas to elaborate theoretical and methodological aspects by testing the four themes. By exploring these four themes, it will contribute further to the development of integrated marketing communications in the future.

Keywords: Integrated marketing, marketing communications, vosviewer, bibliometric analysis.

INTRODUCTION

The development of information and communication technology has had a positive impact on the industrial world. The change in the industrial model towards digital has a major impact on marketing activities carried out by companies in competition in the midst of business competition. The ability to adapt quickly and accurately by involving various digital media and marketing technologies will have a positive influence on the company (Rakshit et al., 2022). Integrated Marketing Communication (IMC), is the process of developing and implementing various forms of persuasive communication programs to customers and prospective customers on an ongoing basis (Sharma & Rahman, 2022). This study aims to conduct research on international scientific articles for integrated marketing communication research, both in terms of themes, locations and research subjects as well as the methods used (Kim et al., 2021). The concept of integrated marketing communications is quite diverse. Marketing communications reintegration is a step through an integrated approach to achieve efficiency (Tiago & Tiago, 2012). Meanwhile, the association of advertising agencies in America defines integrated marketing communication as "a concept known as the added value of a comprehensive plan that evaluates the strategic roles of various communication disciplines and combines these disciplines clearly, consistently and achieves maximum communication impact (Clarke, 2009; Paiva, 2010; Zahid et al., 2022).
In general, research on integrated marketing communication is spread across several countries, both developed and developing countries (Ivanov, 2012). This provides a view of the widespread awareness of the importance of knowledge of integrated marketing communications as a form of integrated marketing communications in an organization (Mihart (Kailani), 2012). All modern organizations, whether business or not-for-profit, use various forms of marketing communications to promote what they offer and achieve financial and non-financial goals (Porcu et al., 2019).

This study provides insight into the distribution of integrated marketing communication research in several countries, years, themes, methods, and the relationship between themes that have been developed. Based on the data that the researchers collected, from 1995 to 2022, there was an increase in research on integrated marketing communication. It can be seen, in 1995, there were only 2 integrated marketing communication studies, but in 1997 there was no research consistent until 2010. However, in 2016, it started to rise and peaked in 2020 with 12 studies. Back down in 2021 and 2022 (it is assumed that there are still many studies in 2022 that have not been included, because in 2022 scientific articles are only collected until June 2022).

**Figure 1.** Number of integrated marketing communication publications  
Source: Authors’ elaboration based on Scopus Database

Based on the description above, this research has a contribution in answering research questions. The main question is what are the themes, research methodologies, research settings (locations and lines of business) in integrated marketing communication research? To answer this question, each section is described below. Therefore, the research questions of our study areas follows:

RQ1. What are the essential bibliometric variables in the integrated marketing communication field?

RQ2. What is the main discussion among researchers in this research flow?

RQ3. What are the theoretical and practical implications so for research in term so future research perspectives?

Bibliometric analysis techniques are applied from all publications in Scopus relative to integrated marketing communication. Bibliometric analysis describes scientific communication quantitatively, makes research structures, central themes and correlations. The detailed analysis will contribute to the development of a careful assessment of the various scientific aspects of integrated marketing communication. It makes theoretical and practical contributions to knowledge.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

Marketing communications began in the 1980's many companies began to look for a broader perspective for marketing communications and the need for a more integrated strategy of the promotional tools that have been used in business. (Vernuccio & Ceccotti, 2015). The advertising industry realizes that integrated marketing communication is not just a trend, but an advertising activity, orchestra, and seamless communication that is used as the definition of the concept of integration (Csikósová et al., 2014). Integrated marketing communication is a blend of various forms of marketing communication ranging from advertising, public relations, internet marketing, personal selling, sales promotion and direct marketing (Paramita et al., 2021). Definition of integrated marketing communication according to the American Association of Advertising Agencies: A concept of marketing communications planning that recognizes the added value of a comprehensive plan that evaluates the strategic roles of a variety communication disciplines for example, general advertising, direct response, sales promotion, and public relations and combines these disciplines to provide clarity, consistency, and maximum communication impact (Dmitrijeva & Batraga, 2012).

Integrated marketing communications requires a perspective for planning marketing and promotional programs and coordinating the various communication functions (Faruk et al., 2021). This requires the company to develop a total marketing communication strategy that will indicate all of the company’s marketing activities, not only promotional activities, communication with consumers. According to integrated marketing communication is managing and coordinating the entire communication process, where some of the most commonly used marketing communication activities are advertising, personal
selling, sales promotion, public relations, and direct marketing, this is in line with what was delivered by Duncan in where there are 5 (five) elements of integrated marketing communication consisting of: advertising; sales promotions; personal selling; public relations (public relations); and direct marketing where (Mihaela, 2015).

Research development related to the involvement of technology in integrated marketing communications activities has been carried out by several experts, for example made a research on interactive integrated marketing communication by combining the strengths of integrated marketing communications, new media and sales database (Lubis & Sulviawati, 2013; Porcu et al., 2020). Since its emergence, integrated marketing communications has expanded from a tactical tool to a strategic business process (Wu et al., 2022). Nevertheless, the need for a more holistic approach is evident from both the academic and practitioner domains. In this regard, integrated marketing communications position as a firm-wide market-relating deployment mechanism that enables the optimization of communication approaches to superior communication effectiveness, while managers and practitioners suggest that integrated marketing communications involves the overall business process, not just marketing communications (Danibrata, 2011).

Similarly, highlight the need to move from definition to operationalization of the integrated marketing communications construct and call for a more expansive empirical measure of integrated marketing communications, sought to respond to the call by developing a conceptual framework based on the broad organizational approach and operationalizing the integrated marketing communications construct by elaborating and empirically validating the firm-wide integrated marketing communications scale (Kandhogo, 2014). In light of this background, this study embraces the broader firm-wide integrated marketing communications approach and builds on the earlier framework that defines integrated marketing communications as a four-dimensional construct, namely message consistency, interactivity, stakeholder-centered strategic focus and organizational alignment (Noveriyanto, 2021).

Integrated marketing communications emerged as a tool that guides marketing practitioners in developing and implementing more consistent and effective marketing communications (Kurniawan et al., 2018). Integrated marketing communications is able to create a brand image, as well as encourage sales, and expand the target market of the company (Musa et al., 2020). The emergence of this concept has become one of the most significant examples of development in the implementation of marketing strategy activities. In this study, the intended application leads to a process of translating all the strategies that have been chosen into an action within the organization so as to achieve the desired goals (Chou et al., 2020).

Integrated marketing communications is the process of managing all sources of information about products/services aimed at consumers or potential consumers who are exposed to consumer behavior with the aim of increasing sales and maintaining consumer loyalty (Wu et al., 2022). On the other hand, he explained that Integrated marketing communications activities are a specific combination of the five most frequently used marketing communication activities by companies, namely advertising, personal selling, sales promotion, public relations, and direct marketing (Englund et al., 2020).

Integrated marketing communications can assist companies in creating coordinated messages consistently across various communication channels, so it is very important to be used as a company strategy in facing various competition in the business world (Rismayanti, 2017).

According to the author, bibliometric research related to integrated marketing communications. Previous research on consumer behavior, marketing communications and marketing management. The author will try to do a literature review related to Integrated marketing communications. Our work starts from the published analysis will be expanded and the results obtained. Our study is original for at least four reasons.

First, we extend and develop the previously obtained results by considering all streams related to integrated marketing communications without placing any time or region restrictions. Second, our study will use several tools based on the VOSviewer software only for cluster analysis that diversifies the results already present in the literature. Third, our proposed study combines some additional and complementary information by considering the growth of publication sources, keyword analysis with derivative searches, and network collaboration. Fourth, the results of our keyword analysis will formulate a discussion framework on integrated marketing communications.

**RESEARCH METHOD**

Bibliometric studies are known for their statistical analysis of books, papers, or other forms of publication (Hood & Wilson, 2001). However, more in-depth bibliometric studies support transparent
quantitative and qualitative analyzes carried out on specific knowledge streams (Zupic & Cater, 2015). To carry out this research, we applied a meta-literature book, which includes both bibliometric (quantitative) and content (qualitative) approaches, and is widely used in the recent literature. The bibliometric approach was first introduced to identify and understand networks based on citations.

As a first step in our analysis, the research team focused on keyword selection. As suggested by Chen and Xiao (2016) and Massaro et al. (2016), keyword selection can be done using a macro (top-down) approach, starting from a broad search path to study and a general topic. Therefore, after considering the prior literature interest in this area and the lack of systematic studies with holistic literature analysis, our research string of papers includes integrate marketing communications as a reference in the Article titles, Abstracts and Keywords. The research analysis implemented using the Scopus database as a multidisciplinary research that allows researchers to study various fields of information science according to the data coverage in every field of research, including the social sciences. In this case, we tested these results by obtaining 149 Scopus articles. Moreover, as suggested by Massaro et al (2016) and previous applied studies (Secinaro et al., 2021), we did not withhold our analysis in the time frame of the study.

Following the above mentioned criteria, the final sample includes 149 documents (analysis as of June 1, 2022). They must be studied using a bibliometric approach that studies the titles and abstracts of each source. This scientific package can help researchers apply bibliometric analysis that supports accurate studies with citations and citations, country of publisher and main author for this research flow. Finally, to get clearer results, the researcher also used Excel software and VOSviewer software (Van Eck & Waltman, 2013). This last tool allows the researcher to study the relationship between keywords, supporting the mapping of the scientific topic being discussed by the researcher. This step is important to provide a structured research agenda for future studies (Secinaro & Calandra, 2020).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

This section will focus on the distribution of the articles and the influential aspect of the integrated marketing communications. The distribution of articles based on the yearly publication and the number of the articles published by the sources of journals. The influential aspect of integrated marketing communications will present the most productive aspects from namely, subject areas, authors, institutions, and countries.

Descriptive Analysis of the Literature

In this session, we will discuss the results of the 149 selected articles by answering two research questions referring to the research setting (theme, subject and location of research implementation), research methodology, and clusters of research themes. It is interesting to see the top sources in the field of integrated marketing communications about the top Affiliates are fairly even.

Figure 2. Number of articles by affiliations (top ten institutions)
Source: Authors’ elaboration based on Scopus Database

Research on integrated marketing communications spreads from several countries. It can be seen from the chart, integrated marketing communications research is carried out in both developed and developing countries develop. Developed countries, namely the United States, United Kingdom, Australia, Spain, China, India, Taiwan, Italy, Finland and Germany. If the use of integrated marketing communications has a large or high value in the company. Integrated marketing communications concepts are described in the context of social marketing, as well as specific stages for creating an Integrated marketing communications social marketing strategy; these include target audience research and determination, channel selection and integration, strategic message creation, and measurement and control. A central and novel feature of the Integrated marketing communications social marketing strategy model is the simultaneous targeting of an upstream decision maker and influential peripheral (upstream) audiences in order to triangulate and increase campaign effectiveness. An integrated marketing communications approach to upstream social marketing ensures consistent, persuasive messages specifically crafted
for the selected target audiences and coordinated through precise channels to maximize impact. This multi-channel, multi-audience approach to message creation and channel selection produces synergies that increase the potential to influence an upstream decision/policy maker.

**Figure 3.** Number of articles by country/territory (top ten)
Source: Authors’ elaboration based on Scopus Database

Table 1. Number of articles by sources (top ten sources)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of the Journal</th>
<th>Articles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Marketing Communications</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Journal of Marketing</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Advertising</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developments in Marketing Science</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proceedings of the Academy of Marketing Science</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Business Research</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Consumer Marketing</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Communications</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Communications An International Journal</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Marketing Quarterly</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial Marketing Management</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ elaboration based on Scopus Database

**Table 1.** Number of articles by sources (top ten sources)

Figure 4 shows the most prolific writers in integrated marketing communications. This table is based solely on the number of publications without considering the author’s impact. The impact of the authors will be discussed in the following sections. Initially, we wanted to present authors.

**Figure 4.** Articles by author
Source: Authors’ elaboration based on Scopus Database

### Bibliometric Mapping and Visualization

Following the aforementioned criteria, the final sample includes 149 documents (analysis as of June 1, 2022). They must be studied using a bibliometric approach that studies the titles and abstracts of each source. This scientific package can help researchers apply bibliometric analysis that supports accurate studies with citations and citations, country of publisher and main author for this research flow. Finally, to get clearer results, the researcher also used Excel software and VOSviewer software. This last tool allows the researcher to study the relationship between keywords, supporting the mapping of the scientific topic being discussed by the researcher. This step is important to provide a structured research agenda for future studies.

**a. Cluster of Integrated marketing communications research themes**

Researchers used VOSviewer software to visualize potential clusters in each word key from the articles reviewed. First, the researcher identified 4 main clusters based on the color difference (red, purple, green and gray) for each topic that appears on the diagram. The color difference describes the relationship/analysis topics that are connected to each other. Then, the node identifies how often the topic is used (Integrated Marketing Communications).
Based on 149 articles studied, this study classifies into 4 clusters, namely clusters of red, purple, green and gray. In the cluster red, the interrelated theme is Integrated marketing communications with communication, brand experience and electronic commerce, in the cluster green the interrelated theme is integrated marketing communications with customer relationship management and data mining, in the cluster purple the interrelated theme is integrated marketing communications with integrated marketing communications and product design, in the cluster gray the interrelated theme is Integrated marketing communications with communication strategy and digital revolution. Marketing objectives, sales volume, market share, return on investment, and profitability are different than integrated marketing communications objectives, which work in favor of both upstream and downstream social marketing objectives.

The essence of integrated marketing management is communication. Appropriate communication objectives are awareness, knowledge, liking, preference, conviction, and behavior. This is often called a hierarchy of effects model, which maps out the response process a receiver of a message goes through before actual behavior. This is the goal of upstream social marketing efforts. One premise of the response process is that communications take time to produce results. In addition, this model presumes that awareness and knowledge requires some cognitive processing. An affective process is involved in terms of liking and preferring a particular message or point of view and that action results from both the cognitive and affective.

b. Co-Authorship Analysis of Authors

Based on VOS viewer software, co-authorship analysis is divided into unit of analysis namely, authors, and institutions. The co-authors’ analysis also revealed the result of the most productive authors, affiliations, and countries as presented in Table previously. Nevertheless, this study only focused on coauthorship of author analysis. The result showed 149 authors, and however, based on VOSviewer, most of them have not connected. It only 18 authors have the largest set of connected items among them as presented in Figure 6. Figure 6 showed the relationship among the 18 authors.
c. **Country Co-Occurrence of Integrated Marketing Communications Research**

The co-occurrence map of countries shows each country’s contribution to the research field. To make the image transparent, this paper analyzed the search results from the Scopus database using. After adjusting the node size, label font size, and node position, the country co-occurrence map (Scopus database) is shown in Figure 7. In Figure 7, node size represents the amount of literature for that country. The more literature there is, the larger the radius of the node for that country is. The color of the outer circle of the node represents the influence of the literature in that country. The thicker the line in the outer circle, the stronger the importance. The gradient color within the node represents the age of the literature published in that country, with warm colors representing recent publications and cool colors representing previous publications. The line between nodes represents when two countries appear in an article simultaneously, with thicker lines indicating more collaboration. The United States is the most documented and influential country, followed by Australia and the United Kingdom.

**Directions for Future Research Avenues**

Based on our descriptive and bibliometric analysis of the integrated marketing communications. With the popularization of new technologies, new communication tools, and new communication concepts, Integrated marketing communications concept, connotation, and implementation will be updated (Hassan, et al., 2020).
Integrated marketing communications research hotspots have been focusing on the latest communication tools and constantly updating their connotations. Integrated marketing communications research topics and bursting keywords can be used to anticipate future integrated marketing communications research trends (Al Qaisi & Alrosan, 2020). At present, social marketing is the mainstream marketing tool, and live streaming with real-time interaction as the main feature is gradually becoming a popular marketing tool. Brand image building is still the top priority of integrated marketing communications (Sulistiyawan, et al., 2019). The research of improving brand awareness and continuously creating marketing triggers in the new environment remains the focus of integrated marketing communications. The metaverse, which incorporates technologies such as blockchain, artificial intelligence, and big data, is a new track for well-known companies to compete and will become a new platform for advertising and marketing in the future (Lu, et al., 2018).

Integrated marketing communications are an effective marketing practice in the age of social media. Integrated marketing communications builds customer relationships and enhances brand value by integrating information from multiple channels and strengthening user interaction. Integrated marketing communications has been a significant advance in marketing communications for decades (Jafari, 2022). It is widely accepted and used by advertising, marketing, and public relations practitioners. Currently, integrated marketing communications is showing its vitality worldwide because of its consumer-centric nature and marketing-based philosophy that provides the basis for user-oriented marketing strategies (Key & Czaplewski, 2017). At the same time, integrated marketing communications is a widely used and widely debated concept on the one side (Tsai, 2005) (Akdeniz, et al., 2010). Despite the numerous studies on integrated marketing communications, there are various research views, and there has been no consensus on the definition of the concept and scope of integrated marketing communications.

Integrated marketing communications differs from traditional marketing communications approaches in many ways. The most revolutionary is that the consumer has become the focus of marketing rather than the product, channel, price, or promotion. The traditional Four-P theory of marketing communication (product, price, place, and promotion) assumes that sales can be achieved if a company produces a reliable quality product, determines the right price, and uses the appropriate channels, complemented by specific promotions (Clarke, 2009).

Another vital difference between integrated marketing communications and traditional marketing communications is the importance of relationship marketing. Traditional marketing communication aims to close the sale, and the end of the transaction means the end of the relationship between the company and the consumer (Paiva, 2010). Applying an integrated marketing communications foundation for the design and execution of an upstream social marketing strategy is a robust solution to navigate today’s complex communications landscape effectively. This is accomplished through a systematic process that begins with detailed research on target audiences, the right channel selections, and effective messaging. The term upstream refers to those who shape the structural and environmental conditions within society, including politicians, policy makers, civil servants, decision makers, regulators, managers, educators, and the media (Ivanov, 2012).

Integrated marketing communications, a very young marketing-related discipline, is still undergoing a stage of conceptualization. While the view of integrated marketing communications was previously focused on the tactical aspect of putting marketing messages together with a variety of communication tools to create a consistent brand image, in recent years it has been shifting toward a more strategic orientation (Mihart (Kailani), 2012). The rationale underlying this shift is very simple: if integrated marketing communications refers to nothing more than tactically delivering commercial messages through a mixture of advertising, public relations, special events, product placement, and sales promotion activities (Vernuccio & Ceccotti, 2015).

Integrated marketing communications, an oft-discussed but divergently conceptualized marketing-related discipline, has never been seriously viewed from the experiential marketing paradigm (Csikösová et al., 2014). As such, integrated marketing communications seems to be out of touch with the emerging but important trend of placing marketing management and communication in the context of the experience economy (Chou et al., 2020). Thus, it is both theoretically and practically appropriate to combine major perspectives of integrated marketing communications by applying the experiential marketing paradigm, in order that the overarching task of today’s marketers (consumer experience management) may be duly incorporated into the conceptualization of integrated marketing communications. Before we engage in an in-depth discussion regarding
how integrated marketing communications is conceptualized with the experiential marketing paradigm, it is necessary to take a look at the two major, but distinct, perspectives of integrated marketing communications: strategic communications and strategic brand management.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

The integration of effective and efficient and appropriate Integrated marketing communications activities will affect many aspects of the company and the products being marketed. So that the planning of Integrated marketing communications activities requires careful preparation and is controlled by people who have high competence in this field. Integrated marketing communications activities require support from various divisions of the company, both the marketing division, research and development division, and other divisions. Integrated marketing communications emerged as a tool that guides marketing practitioners in developing and implementing more consistent and effective marketing communications. Integrated marketing communications is able to create a brand image, as well as drive sales, and expand the company's target market.

The research of improving brand awareness and continuously creating marketing triggers in the new environment remains the focus of integrated marketing communications. The metaverse, which incorporates technologies such as blockchain, artificial intelligence, and big data, is a new track for well-known companies to compete and will become a new platform for advertising and marketing in the future.

As for the future research trends. In the foreseeable future, integrated marketing communication will usher in the renewal of concepts and the reconstruction of models to adapt to the new round of technological revolution and changes brought about by user experience innovation. Considering the regular pattern of integrated marketing communications concept change and comparing the evolution of integrated marketing communications concepts and research topics in different periods. This study has several limitations and offers suggestions for future research. First, the data collected in this paper are limited to English literature in Scopus databases and do not cover other literature sources. Thus, the results may be biased. Second, most retrieved literature was studied in developed countries, but there is relatively little literature from emerging markets. Future researchers could use more data sources and retrieve literature from non-English speaking countries and WoS database to obtain more complete results. In addition, future studies could specifically target some countries where integrated marketing communication is developing faster to obtain more comprehensive results.

REFERENCES


